

2020-08-26 - [CNTT - RM Workstream Master] Agenda and Meeting Minutes

Attendees:

Please add your name in here:

- [Walter Kozlowski](#) (Telstra)
- [Pankaj Goyal](#) (AT&T)
- [Tom Van Pelt](#) (GSMA)
- [Ulrich Kleber](#) (Huawei)
- [Suresh Krishnan](#) (Kaloomb)
- [Sukhdev Kapur](#) (Juniper)
- [Petar Torre](#) (Intel)
- [Gergely Csatai](#) (Nokia)
- [Toshiyasu Wakayama](#) (KDDI)
- [Per Andersson](#) (Kaloomb)
- [Trevor Cooper](#) (Intel)

Special Notes:

- **Weekly RM meetings are intended to**
 - Plan RM and Network related work
 - Identify owners for new Issues/PRs
 - Track open Issues/PRs
 - Address technical issues that cannot be resolved online (i.e. resolve stalls)

Agenda:

- [Linux Foundation Anti-Trust Policy Not](#)
- [GSMA Anti-Trust Policy Notice](#)
- Recording Policies:
 - <https://zoom.us/rec/play/uMAuluyogG43EtWS4QSDAf4oW9XsKP2s1CQW-fYNzXu3VSiGN1L3Z7YSNOX-H7MYUyogBulNABoVavXq?autoplay=true&startTime=1589371628000>
- Meeting Recording:
 - <https://zoom.us/rec/share/vuwuALXI8XNJWJHSzW35WP5mQlIfneaa8hiUX-aBezB5xhyVFYSK-WHoUZx-6YZeW>
- Agenda bashing
- Agenda
 - OITF Update: The NG subgroup for managing the RM as a GSMA PRD has been set up now. The group's page would be available on the GSMA infocentre at this link: <https://infocentre2.gsma.com/gp/wg/IR/OITF/Pages/Default.aspx> and that's where it should be joined. There is a "join group" button when you're not a member yet. OITF tasks and next steps: [CNTT RM management process in GSMA_v6.pptx](#). Kick-off meeting on 3 September 2020
 - Date for clean-up and handover to GSMA: target 14 Sep with handover before end of September - Plan how to achieve this
 - Acceleration: Review and reconcile differences between RM, Appendix, and documents in <https://github.com/cntt-n/CNTT/tree/master/doc/common#4.0> (Policies vs Introduction, as an example). See Actions and Minutes
 - Issue 255: Is this really RM or rather RI issue? Need to discuss. Decision: close the issue as implementation specific
 - Status of Security sections cleanup - see table below
 - Storage status - see table below, and actions
 - Status of LCM sections review/cleanup
 - Need to add specific requirements for Assurance in a table format, Sec 9.3 - need to create a separate issue and PRs, most likely post Baraque/handover
 - Multi-cloud gap into RM: PR [#1857](#)/1858 Approved/Merged
 - Discussion point: how much of "Virtual network specifications" we need to add to RM, after Baraque

Chapter. Section	Content	Status/Issues	Owner	Comments
Chapter 0	https://github.com/cntt-n/CNTT/tree/master/doc/common	Merged /Closed		Merged into master Future updates via separate PRs
Chapter 1	https://github.com/cntt-n/CNTT/blob/master/doc/ref_model/chapters/chapter01.md	Merged /Closed		Merged into master Future updates via separate PRs
Chapter 2	https://github.com/cntt-n/CNTT/blob/master/doc/ref_model/chapters/chapter02.md	Merged /Closed		Merged into master Future updates via separate PRs

Chapter 3	https://github.com/cnnt-n/CNTT/blob/master/doc/ref_model/chapters/chapter03.md	Merged /Closed		Merged into master Future updates via separate PRs
Chapter 4.1, 4.2	Address issues	GSMA feedback Issues: 1765	Ahmed	Issue #1765: [RM Ch4, Appendix] 'Missing exception for FPGA-s or other accelerators' Closed in PRs #1922, #1923, #1925
Chapter 4.3	Network, new content (done)	Merged /Closed	Walter Thomas	Issue #587 'Virtual network specifications need rework in Chapter 4' CLOSED by Walter Kozlowski as this relates to pre Baldy contents and Chapter 4 has been updated since then. General discussion point is: how much of "Virtual network specifications" we need to add to RM, after Baraque
Chapter 5.1, 5.2 (software)	Address issues	Merged /Closed		
Chapter 5.3, 5.4 (Hardware)	Address issues	Merged /Closed	Karine	
Chapter 6	Address issues	Merged /Closed	Pankaj	
Chapter 7 Security	Rewrite, address issue. Walter Kozlowski review : <ol style="list-style-type: none">1. Need to add a shared security model in a diagrammatic form? Can be post Baraque if too hard now.2. 7.4.1.2 - need to divide into subgroups of related requirements3. Need to de-duplicate 7.4.1.2 and 7.4.2, for example introduce a Common requirements group in 7.4.1.2 and refer to it in 7.4.2, and then add specifics for backup-end security4. 7.6 (operator's workload responsibility) is different from 7.4.1 (operator's platform responsibility).5. 7.9, 7.10, 7.11 need to be reviewed in detail by a security expert; Amy Zwarico can you assist?	GSMA feedback Issues: 1754, 1755,	Karine	Karine Sevilla to create a list of sections needed assistance and request help from the group Clean up issue#1881 CLOSED -> PR #1882 MERGED But the chapter still needs review and clean up for: <ul style="list-style-type: none">• section Root of trust: right place? WK: looks OK to me• 7.6 content somehow redundant with 7.4.1 and a lot of details, e.g. on RTM, is it necessary here; WK: see (6) in the left column• 7.4.1.2: list presentation could be enhanced, WK: agreed, see (3,4) in the left column Walter to contribute to resolve these issues
Chapter 8 Conformance, Verification, and Certification	https://github.com/cnnt-n/CNTT/blob/master/doc/ref_model/chapters/chapter08.md	Merged /Closed		Merged into master Future updates via separate PRs
Chapter 9 LCM	Address issues	GSMA feedback /addressed	Walter Pankaj	Contents complete for Baraque. This topic will need more reviews and updates for the next releases.
Chapter 10.3.1 Discovery	New content	Merged /Closed		
Chapter 10.3.2 Load balancing	New content	Merged /Closed		
Chapter 10.3.3 Service Function Chain	New content	Merged /Closed		
Chapter 10.3.4 Packet acceleration	New content	Merged /Closed		Issue #1861 from Pankaj Goyal to be resolved with Suresh Krishnan
Chapter 10.3.5	New content	Merged /Closed		

Appendix A	Address issues	GSMA feedback Issues:1306 (SR-IOV), 1459, 1765 (also Ch4 issue)	Walter	Walter Kozlowski sent out a plan for the RM team on 26 August, plan in execution Closed in PRs #1922, #1923, #1925
Overall editing	Address issues	GSMA feedback Issues #1625 (number consistency)	Walter	
Overall topics for Baraque (per Rabi's plan)				
Networking Modelling	Review RM and add/update content		Tom	
Networking & Storage Characterization	Review RM and add/update content		Karine Petar	Petar updating Chapter 3
Full Containerization support	Review RM and add/update content		Walter	
HW Acceleration support	Review RM and add/update content		Ahmed	
Edge	Review RM and add/update content		Ahmed	

Actions:

Sukhdev write up a principle on Infra advertising acceleration capabilities to workloads and scheduling (26/08), Petar to help

Pankaj send some wording of Principles

Petar working on a paragraph for Chapter 3 on storage virtual vs physical split

Minutes:

8. Workload independence from Cloud Infrastructure (hardware and software) acceleration

9. Workload independence from hardware

- This is in support of workload abstraction, enabling portability across the Infra and simplification of workload design
- Use of critical features in this category are governed by policies and exceptions in RA documents

10. Abstraction of specific internal hardware details above the Infrastructure Cloud Management layers unless is managed through Hardware Infrastructure Manager

- This is in support of workload abstraction, enabling portability across the Infra and simplification of workload design
- Use of critical features in this category are governed by policies and exceptions in RA documents

Remove Appendix Exceptions (these will be done in RAs)

Chapter 4 table 4.2 change exceptions in RM to details in RAs